# EFFECTIVENESS OF HRD IN PRIVATE SECTOR: A CASE FROM THE KINGDOM OF BAHRAIN

## LA'ALEH AL-AALI

Business Administration Systems Program E-mail: laaleh.alaali@aou.org.bh

**Abstract** - The Gulf Corporation Countries (GCC) still face the challenge of creating the private sector as a vehicle towards building a diversified economy less dependent on the oil sector through forming the private sector as an employer of choice to nationals. It has long been criticized that GCC nationals do not prefer the private sector viewing it as a less attractive sector. Despite, governmental efforts to form the private sector as an attractive sector , the dependency on foreign labor stays at 70%. The research explores strategies that have been developed in the GCC for forming the private sector as an employer of choice which reveal the presence of "Human Resource Development" strategies as a solution to attract nationals towards private sector employment. The paper presents a review of governmental strategies and its importance in retaining employees within organizations, the study reveals that nationals in Bahrain prefer the government sector despite the presence of extensive HRD strategies. Hence, this raises a deserved area of exploration towards the investments of HRD strategies for private sector versus the retention of nationals within private sector in other GCC states as well. The research data collection has focused on the Kingdom of Bahrain by collecting data from four private sector organizations to assess the presence of HRD and nationals view towards government sector employment. The study reveals findings towards the importance of forming policies that form the private sector an employer of choice through extrinsic means by restructuring the remuneration structure.

Keywords - Capacity Building, Human Resource Development, national labor participation

# I. INTRODUCTION

One of the main challenges of the labour market in the Gulf Corporation Countries (GCC) is to form the private sector as an attractive employer of choice for nationals. The strategies to support national labour within the GCC economy are evident through the creation of government entities and authorities. The government entities formed strategies which embed the Human Resource Development concept aiming to build capacities of local labour within the private sector. Despite the evident market reform initiatives through government strategies, the average number of non-nationals in GCC states is close to 70 per cent (Fasano 2003, Kapiszewski 2004).

Government authorities have embedded Human Resource Development strategies to address unemployment and labour force participation among nationals, but the low returns yielded merit a close study. The rates were recorded in Bahrain with 50 per cent, Saudi Arabia 65 per cent, Kuwait 82 per cent, Qatar almost 90 per cent, and 90 per cent in UAE (Gulf Cooperation Council 2002; Human Rights Watch 2004; Fasano and Goyal 2004; Girgis 2002). The researcher focused in the paper presented on one GCC state which is the Kingdom of Bahrain owing to the dearth in publications about Bahrain national labor participation in publications. In addition, the researcher aims cooperation with other researchers from other GCC states to explore the efficiency of HRD based on the conceptual model analyzed by the researcher. The paper presents an analysis of GCC entities and authorities that have developed strategies

to increase national labor participation. It is evident that Bahrain and other GCC states share common strategies aimed to form the private sector as employer of choice. The data collection focused on the private sector in Bahrain by exploring four private sector organization nationalization strategies. It examined the effect of the HRD presence to create the private sector as an employer of choice to nationals. The findings indicate that despite the presence of HRD , nationals still prefer the government sector. This raises the crucial need to move investments of HRD towards compensatory benefits that will form the private sector as an attractive choice for nationals. The research findings need to be further investigated in other GCC states to examine whether compensation can create the private sector as an employer of choice for nationals.

Though GCC Governments' approaches to labour market reforms embed HRD but it relies to a large extent on setting quotas. Measures to curb the growth of foreign workers included mandated targets for "nationalization" in different employment sectors, permit requirements and levy fees for foreign workers, and attractive incentives and preferential treatment for companies adhering to nationalization policies (Maloney 1998; Ruppert 1998; Mashood and Veroheaven 2009). The policy of Emiratization has been described as not being realized "in its full by means of its current form of scope" implementation, which reflects the inability to achieve 'balance' in the labour market owing to the threat of not being able to meet labour market needs (Al Shaiba 2008; Robert 2009). Godwin (2006) views

Volume-4, Issue-8, Aug.-2018

Emiratization as an affirmative action quota-driven employment policy that ensures UAE nationals are given employment opportunities in the private sector through quotas set within selected industries considered suitable for national men and women to work in (Morris 2005). In 1995, Saudi Arabia passed legislation requiring every employer of twenty or more workers to employ a minimum 5 per cent of Saudi nationals which was increased to 25 per cent in 2000, 30 per cent in 2002 and 75 per cent in 2005 (Al-Kibsi et al. 2007). In Oman, a circular enforced that Omanis should hold at least 75 per cent of senior and middle management positions (Winckler 2009b). A further trend in all GCC countries recently has been to totally ban immigrant workers in specific occupations, with Kuwait as the last country to embrace this policy approach (Shah 2008). Certain jobs, such as HR managers, secretaries and public relations officers were limited to Emiratis only (Forstenlechner 2008). Similarly in Oman, different Omanization percentages are set for local companies, including support services, engineers and draughtsman in the oil and gas sector (Directorate General of Employment 2008). The Saudi government has set percentages for different positions and industries. A general requirement to increase Saudi manpower by five per cent annually, reducing the number of expatriate workers to 20 per cent of the total population in a decade, has accelerated Saudization of the banking sector (Looney 2004). Another restriction aimed at discouraging expatriates was that non-nationals were barred from entering into a commercial venture without a national partner in order to involve nationals in the new projects that were being undertaken in various economic fields; however, this has instead led to the appearance of 'silent partners' who merely sign contracts and complete formalities while receiving 51 per cent of the revenues (Winckler 2006). Looking at the nationalization programmes in the GCC, it becomes clear that they all focus on reducing the reliance on expatriates by replacing them with local workers and are all seen as 'positive discrimination' on behalf of local nationals (Mashood and Veroheaven 2009; 2005). Even though GCC labour Suter nationalization policies focus on encouraging nationals to view the private sector as a viable career option (Forstenlechner 2011), the nationalization policies of GCC countries are considered an interventionist approach taken by governments (Harry 2007) with the aim of reducing the countries' reliance on expatriate labour and increasing the participation of nationals in the labour market (Wilkins 2001). The various government labour nationalization policies are yet to achieve their goals as unemployment rates remain in double figures in all GCC states (Forstenlechner 2008). The measures and restrictions imposed, such as the sponsorship system and the rotational system of expatriate labour to limit the duration of foreigners' stay, have not brought the

expected results (Kapiszewski 2006). Stricter regulation seems to be an unlikely option; rather, the government needs to move towards adopting a softer approach more focused on education and less on quotas (TANMIA 2006; AMEInfo 2007a, 2007b). Fasano et. al. (2003) believe that GCC governments are aware of the drawbacks of a quick localization of the labour force and have now moved towards focusing on long-term structural solutions for retraining and educational reforms to meet mediumand long-term skill demands.

Mashood and Veroheaven (2009) explain how the approach to nationalization in the United Arab Emirates, Saudi Arabia and Oman is one of intervention rather than using a normative approach which debates the success of the nationalization. GCC governments have been focused on a quick-fix of replacing expatriates, most of who have jobs that are undesirable to locals, and instead should focus on encouraging education and entrepreneurship to create jobs that local nationals will want to do (Harry 2007). Weir (2008) emphasizes that "It is imperative for the region's human resource departments to work differently. They need to think as marketers and to create a powerful and persuasive talent value proposition." Achieving a balanced workforce needs a rigorous approach focusing on multiple dimensions, not just those which are immediately obvious (Jasem Ahmad Al Ali of the Dubai Municipality, as reported by Ashfaq Ahmed, Gulf News 2008). Forstenlechner (2008) recommends the use of a combined measure that includes the average length of service of nationals on the payroll, the promotional track-record of nationals and the quantity and quality of on-the-job training and support provided to national employees. measures alone Quantitative cannot gauge localization success, qualitative methods are also required that show the attitudinal and motivational states of localization processes and how these relate to traditional change management (Rees 2007). Marchona and Toledoa (2014) observe that there is considerable evidence in the economics literature that labor quotas appear to reduce productivity.

The above views criticize that GCC policies rely heavily on "quantitative" measures though reviewing the efforts of the authorities provide strong evidence of the presence of being "qualitative" through the HRD efforts. Hence, the researcher explores the effect of HRD which is considered a "qualitative" approach to attract nationals towards private sector.

# **II. DATA COLLECTION**

The data was collected by designing a questionnaire which focused on the HRD concepts derived from the HRD definitions reviewed. The questionnaire was distributed among Bahraini employees ( below managerial level) in four private sector organizations. The organizations respective sectors were retail, tourism, hospitality and petrochemical). The data International Journal of Management and Applied Science, ISSN: 2394-7926 http://irai.in

received from 250 questionnaires were analyzed through SPSS.

# **III. FINDINGS**

The below tables indicate the data collection findings. The tables ( A, B,) are analyzed as per the HRD activities derived from the literature review with respective responses of employees collected from Bahraini employees in private sector Bahrain. Table C indicates the views of the employees with respective to government jobs.

#### **Training and Development**

Assessing the percentages under the training and development theme, it is evident that there is a high level of agreement reflecting the process of training in organizations. The researcher structured the questions regarding training and development in terms of attendance, management, nomination, mutual agreement and job alignment. The percentages of agreement were high in all areas as

specified in the table below, and specifically the highest percentage related to managers' support in training and organizations, i.e. building the learning culture. According to the statistics, 46 per cent of Bahrainis have managers that encourage and support their training and 43 per cent strongly agreed to having organizations that promote a learning culture. Management encouragement for training had the highest mean of 4.06 while organizations promoting learning culture had a mean of 4.05 in the set of questions relating to the training and development theme. The question with the lowest mean of 2.82 was related to the employees' hesitance to request training from their organization. Thirty four per cent of the Bahrainis were neutral in terms of requesting training from their organizations. The questions with the highest disagreement percentages reflect the positive percentages in training activities in private sector organizations. Referring to the table, 18 per cent strongly disagreed to being hesitant to request training while 15 per cent disagreed with attending two training courses per year.

Table A- Training and development for nationals in Banrain private sector									
	FQY /							STD	
Question	РСТ	SA	Α	Ν	D	SD	Mean	DEV.	
I am trained at a regular basis	Frequency	199	136	73	51	16	3.95	1.143	
	Percent	41.8	28.6	15.3	10.7	3.4			
I attend at least 2 training courses	Frequency	188	122	59	72	33	3.76	1.304	
per year	Percent	39.5	25.6	12.4	15.1	6.9	5.70		
Am given the opportunity to	Frequency	138	123	119	62	34	3.57	1.232	
choose my training programs	Percent	29.0	25.8	25.0	13.0	7.1			
My manager only nominates me	Frequency	150	175	88	45	16	3.84	1.078	
for a training program	Percent	31.5	36.8	18.5	9.5	3.4			
Training programs are mutually	Frequency	141	160	118	36	21	3.76	1.091	
agreed by myself and manager	Percent	29.6	33.6	24.8	7.6	4.4			
Training programs are aligned with	Frequency	184	155	82	38	14	3.97	1.073	
my job requirements	Percent	38.7	32.6	17.2	8.0	2.9			
Am hesitant to request training	Frequency	33	107	162	84	86	2.82	1.177	
from my organization	Percent	6.9	22.5	34.0	17.6	18.1			
Training programs in my	Frequency	115	198	93	49	21		1.078	
organization meet development	<b>D</b>	24.2	41.6	19.5	10.3	4.4	3.71		
needs for promotion at work	Percent					10			
Training is well managed in my	Frequency	189	134	102	35	13	3.95	1.076	
organization	Percent	39.7	28.2	21.4	7.4	2.7			
My manager encourages and	Frequency	217	132	81	30	16	4.06	1.086	
supports my training	Percent	45.6	27.7	17.0	6.3	3.4			
My organization promotes a	Frequency	203	135	97	22	13	4.05	1.037	
learning culture	Percent	42.6	28.4	20.4	4.6	2.7			

Table A- Training and development for nationals in Bahrain private sector

Career Development and Performance Management Analyzing career progression as an HRD activity through the questionnaire, there is significant agreement in several areas as explained in this section. A high percentage of Bahrainis responded affirmatively towards appraisal discussions and career promotion by development through management support and organizational culture. The factor of career path limitation had a high percentage in terms of being 'neutral'. In addition, response towards the question of whether career progression retains employees in the organizations was significantly neutral.

The highest agreement percentage of around 50.8 related to the organizations engagement of a culture of promotion through development programmes. Looking at the highest mean in the table below, which is 3.78, this relates to development through promotion. As highlighted below, over 30 per cent of the Bahrainis strongly agree that managers develop and guide them to be promoted. Although 37 per cent of Bahrainis see career prospects in their private sector organizations, neverthless there were higher

International Journal of Management and Applied Science, ISSN: 2394-7926 http://irai.in

neutral responses in terms of viewing career prospects. As indicated below, 39 per cent of the Bahrainis were neutral towards career limitations in their department, 50 were are neutral towards career limitations in their organization, and 41 per cent had neutral views regarding career progression retaining them within their private sector organization. Around 44 per cent of the Bahrainis agree that career progression is discussed during their appraisals, 36 per cent agree that they had their careers discussed when they first joined the organization, while 47 per cent were neutral as to whether their career progression was discussed more than a year after they joined the private sector organization.

	FOY /							STD
Question	PCT	SA	Α	Ν	D	SD	Mean	DEV.
My manager develops me to be	Frequency	158	139	117	31	28	2 70	1.153
promoted	Percent	33.2	29.2	24.6	6.5	5.9	3.78	
My manager communicates to me openly regarding my next career	Frequency	57	197	131	52	38	3.39	1.085
	Percent	12.0	41.4	27.5	10.9	8.0		
My manager guides me towards	Frequency	148	135	110	54	28		1.194
achieving a higher position in the organization	Percent	31.1	28.4	23.1	11.3	5.9	3.68	
I see career prospects in my	Frequency	90	177	138	47	22	3.56	1.051
organization	Percent	18.9	37.2	29.0	9.9	4.6	5.50	
Career progression is discussed	Frequency	35	208	120	82	30	3.29	1.038
during yearly appraisal	Percent	7.4	43.7	25.2	17.2	6.3		
Career paths are limited in my	Frequency	54	144	186	65	23	3.30	1.004
department	Percent	11.3	30.3	39.1	13.7	4.8		
Career paths are limited in my	Frequency	40	100	240	73	23	3.13	0.937
organization	Percent	8.4	21.0	50.4	15.3	4.8	5.15	
Career progression retains me at my	Frequency	47	147	197	58	26	3.28	0.986
organization	Percent	9.9	30.9	41.4	12.2	5.5	3.20	
Career progression was discussed	Frequency	82	171	117	72	33	3.41	1.145
when I first joined the organization	Percent	17.2	35.9	24.6	15.1	6.9	5.41	
Career progression was discussed	Frequency	24	89	225	100	37		0.953
after more than a year of joining the organization	Percent	5.0	18.7	47.3	21.0	7.8	2.92	
Besides, high performance my	Frequency	38	242	134	41	20		
organization engages in a culture of promotion through development programs	Percent	8.0	50.8	28.2	8.6	4.2	3.50	0.915

Table B- Career Development and Performance Management for nationals in Bahrain private sector

# Government versus private sector preference among Bahrainis

The literature review identified reports that nationals in the Middle East have a tendency to seek work in the government as opposed to the private sector. It is evident that similarly to their neighbouring GCC nationals, Bahrainis also prefer the government sector. Fifty per cent of the respondents strongly agree that they prefer working in the government sector; 49 per cent strongly agree that the government sector has better compensation and benefits while only 13 per cent strongly agree that the government sector has more career opportunities. Forty eight percent of the respondents strongly agreed that they would leave their job in the private sector for a government job. In addition, 53 per cent of them strongly agree that they joined the private sector because they did not find an opportunity in the government sector.

STD

								SID
Question	FQY / PCT	SA	Α	Ν	D	SD	Mean	DEV.
I prefer working in the government sector	Frequency	239	70	85	45	28	3.96	1.273
	Percent	50.2	14.7	17.9	9.5	5.9		
In general, the government	Frequency	232	90	61	63	19		
sector has better compensation and benefits than the private sector	Percent	48.7	18.9	12.8	13. 2	4.0	3.97	1.242
Government sector has more opportunities for career progression	Frequency	60	81	102	11 8	10 4	2.73	1.331
	Percent	12.6	17.0	21.4	24. 8	21. 8		
I would leave my current job for a job in the government sector	Frequency	229	79	75	55	26	3.93	1.277
	Percent	48.1	16.6	15.8	11. 6	5.5		
I joined the private sector	Frequency	251	77	52	47	41		
because I did not find an opportunity in the government sector	Percent	52.7	16.2	10.9	9.9	8.6	3.96	1.356

Table C - Government versus private sector preference among Bahrainis

International Journal of Management and Applied Science, ISSN: 2394-7926

#### **IV. DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS**

The above tables indicate the presence of HRD activities such as training, development, career development and performance management are strongly evident with high satisfaction rates by Bahrainis. Despite, the high response agreement towards HRD activities, yet Forty eight percent of the respondents strongly agreed that they would leave their job in the private sector for a government job. Reviewing the practices of HRD, it reveals that compensation and benefits are the factors that attract Bahrainis towards employment. The data shows that 49 per cent strongly agree that the government sector has better compensation and benefits. Data indicates that only 13 per cent strongly agree that the government sector has more career opportunities with 21 percent had neutral views towards government sector career progression. Hence, the study reveals that compensation and benefits is the way to attract Bahrainis towards employment.

## CONCLUSIONS

The policy of enforcing national labour participation in Bahrain needs to be strengthened through extrinsic means of compensation and benefits rather than having investments on HRD practices as it is viewed by Bahrainis as an attractive means towards being retained in private sector. The findings require further study by applying towards every GCC state to assess whether other nationals share the same views as Bahrainis. If extrinsic means is a vehicle towards forming attraction to private sector this shall raise crucial strategic planning of policies that focus on compensation and benefits. This reveals a deserved area of study whether to focus on HRD solely, compensation and benefits solely or to take the "multidimensional" view of combining both. But combination of both extrinsic and intrinsic values shall cause further pressure on investments. Hence, every GCC state needs to explore views of its nationals to meet their needs that will form private sector an attractive employer of choice.

#### REFERENCES

- Al-Kibsi, G., Benkert, C., and Schubert, J. (2007), Getting Labor Policy to Work in the Gulf. The McKinsey Quarterly Special Edition: Reappraising the Gulf States, February, pp. 1–29
- [2] Debrah, Y.A (2006) 'Human Resource Development of Professionals in an emerging economy: The case of the Tanzanian construction industry', International Journal of Human Resource Management, Vol.17, No. 3, pp. 440
- [3] Fasano, G. and Goyal, R. (2004) Emerging Strains in GCC Labor Markets, International Monetary Fund
- [4] Fasano, U. and Iqbal, Z. (2003) GCC Countries: from Oil dependence to Diversification, Washington D.C.: International Monetary Fund
- [5] Fasano, Ugo and Rishi Goyal (2004) Emerging strains in GCC labour markets. Washington, D.C.: International Monetary Fund, Working Paper

- [6] Forstenlechner, I. (2011) ' Emiratisation: determining the factors that influence the recruitment decisions of employers in the UAE', International journal of human resource management, Vol. 23, No. 2, pg. 406
- [7] Forstenlechner, I. (2008) 'Workforce nationalization in the UAE: image versus integration', Education, Business and Society: Contemporary Middle Eastern Issues, Vol. 1, No. 2, pp.82-91
- [8] Forstenlechner, I. (2009) 'Workforce localization in emerging Gulf economies: the need to fine-tune HRM', Personnel Review, Vol. 39, No. 1, pp.135 – 152
- [9] Forstenlechner, I., and Rutledge, E.J. (2010) 'Growing Levels of National Unemployment in the Arab Gulf: Time to Update the "Social Contract",' Middle East Policy, Vol. 17, No. 2, pp. 38–51
- [10] Forstenlechner, I., Madi, M., Selim, H. and Rutledge, E. (2012) 'Emiratisation: determining the factors that influence the recruitment decisions of employers in the UAE, The International Journal of Human Resource Management', Journal of Human Resource Management, Vol. 23, No. 2, pp.406-421
- [11] Garavan, T.N., McGuire, D. and O'Donnell, D. (2004) 'Exploring Human Resource Development: A Levels of Analysis Approach false', Human Resource Development Review, Vol. 3, No. 4, pp. 417-441
- [12] Gulf (2008) Inflation, Saudisation and Politics: Pressure Still on, Gulf April, pp. 2-3
- [13] Harbison, F., & Myers, C. A. (1964). Education, manpower, and economic growth: Strategies of human resource development. New York: McGraw-Hill
- [14] Harry, W. (2007) 'Employment creation and localization: the crucial human resource issue for the GCC', International Journal of Human Resource Management, Vol. 18, No. 1, pp. 132-146
- [15] IMF (2004) Emerging Strains in GCC Labor Markets. IMF Working Paper WP/04/71, International Monetary Fund
- [16] Kapiszewski, A. (2006) 'Arab versus Asian migrant workers in the GCC countries', Work 1051-9815
- [17] Kapiszewski, A. (2000) ' Population, labour and education dilemmas facing GCC states at the urn of the century', available at: www.crm,hct.ae/events/archuve/tend/AndKP.html (accessed March 2012)
- [18] Kapiszewski, A. (2003) ' The changing status of Arab migrant workers in the GCC ', Journal of Social Affairs, Vol. 20, No. 78, pp. 33-60
- [19] Kapiszewski, A. (2001) Nationals and Expatriates, Reading: Ithaca Press
- [20] Lincoln, Y.S. and Guba, E.G. (2000) Paradigmatic controversies, contradictions and emerging influences. In N.K. Denzin and Y.S. Lincoln (Eds) Handbook of Qualitative Research (2nd Ed.) Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage
- [21] MacNamara and Weeks (1982) 'The action learning model of experiential learning for developing managers', Human Relations, Vol. 35, No. 10, pp. 879–901
- [22] Mashood, N., Verhoeven, H, and Chansarkar, B. (2009) Emiratisation, Omanisation and Saudisation – Common causes: Common solutions? Retrieved on (2- February 2012) from http://www.wbiconpro.com/17.%20 Helen-UAE.pdf
- [23] McLagan, P. (1989) The Models: Models for HRD Practice, American Society for Training and Development, Alexandria: VA
- [24] McLean, G. (2003) National HRD keynote lecture. 2nd Asian Academy of HRD Conference, National Institute of Development Administration, Bangkok, 30 November–2 December, Thailand
- [25] McLean, G. (2004) National human resource development: what in the world is it? Keynote lecture. 5th International Conference on HRD Research across Europe, Limerick, 27 – 8 May, University Forum of HRD Conference Proceedings
- [26] McLean, G. and McLean, L. (2001) 'If we can't define HRD in one country, how can we define it in an international

Effectiveness of HRD in Private Sector: A Case From The Kingdom of Bahrain

International Journal of Management and Applied Science, ISSN: 2394-7926 http://iraj.in Volume-4, Issue-8, Aug.-2018

context?", Human Resource Development International, Vol. 4, No. 3, pp. 313 – 26

- [27] McLean, G. N., Bartlett, R. K. and Cho, E. (2003) 'HRD as national policy: Republic of Korea and New Zealand', Pacific Asian Education, Vol. 15, No. 1, pp. 41-59
- [28] McLean, G. N., Osman-Gani, A., and Cho, E. (2004) 'Human resource development as national policy', Advances in Developing Human Resources, Vol. 6, No. 3
- [29] McLean, I.M. and McLean, L.D. (2001) 'If we can't define HRD in one country, how can we define it in an international context?' Human Resource Development International, Vol 4, No3, pp. 313 -26
- [30] Megginson, D., Joy-Matthews, J. and Banfield, P. (1993) Human Resource Development, London: Kogan Page
- [31] Mellahi, K. (2000) Human resource development through vocational education in Gulf Cooperation Countries: the case of Saudi Arabia, Journal of Vocational Education and Training, Vol. 52, No. 2, pp. 329-344
- [32] Mellahi, K. and Al-Hinai, S. (2000) 'Local Workers in Gulf Co-operation Countries: Assets or Liabilities?', Middle Eastern Studies, Vol. 26, No. 3, pp. 177–91
- [33] Mellahi, K. and Wood, G. (2002) 'Desperately Seeking Stability: The Making and Remaking of the Saudi Arabian Petroleum Growth Regime', Competition and Change, Vol. 6, No.4, pp. 345–62
- [34] Paprock, K. E. (2006) National human resource development in transitioning societies in the developing world: Introductory overview, Advances in Developing Human Resources, Vol. 8, No. 1, pp. 12-27
- [35] Rees, C.J., Mamman, A. and Bin Braik, A. 2007 'Emiratization as a strategic HRM change initiative: case study evidence from UAE petroleum company', International Journal of Human Resource Management, Vol. 18, No.1, pp. 33-53

- [36] Shaffer, G. (2005) Can WTO Technical Assistance and Capacity Building serve developing countries? Loyoloa University :Chicago
- [37] Shaham, D. (2009) Foreign Labor in the Arab Gulf: Challenges to Nationalization. Al Nakhlah, Fall 2008
- [38] Tanmia (2006) 'The national human resource development & employment authority', United Arab Emirates, [Online] Available http://www.tamnia.ae (last accessed 2nd February 2012)
- [39] TANMIA (2004) Emiratisation in the Banking Sector: Factors Influencing Success and Failure, TANMIA, Dubai
- [40] TANMIA (2006) Human Resource Report 2005, TANMIA, Dubai
- [41] Walton, J. (1999) Strategic Human Resource Development, Harlow: Pearson Education Limited
- [42] Walton, J. (1996) The provision of learning support for nonemployees, in: J. Stewart and J. McGoldrick (Eds) Human Resource Development: Perspectives, Strategies and Practice, pp. 120 – 37, London: Pitman
- [43] Walton, J. S. (2003) How shall a thing be called? An argument on the efficacy of the term HRD, Human Resource Development Review, Vol. 2, No. 3
- [44] Wilkins, S. (2002) 'Human resource development through vocational education in the United Arab Emirates: the case of Dubai polytechnic', Journal of Vocational Education and Training, Vol. 54, No. 1, pp. 5-26
- [45] Winckler, O. (2009) Arab Political Demography, second edition, Brighton: Sussex Academic Press
- [46] Winckler, O. (2009)'Labor and Liberalization: The Decline of the GCC Rentier System', in J. Teiterlbaum (ed.), Political Liberalization in the Persian Gulf. New York: Columbia University Press, pp. 59–85

\*\*\*